

## **Council-ACOM Working Group on Strengthening the Advisory Leadership (CAWGSAL)**

*Council is invited to approve the report of CAWGSAL and the proposed changes to the Rules of procedure.*

*This document has been amended following the Council meeting to reflect the decisions of the Council.*

### **1 Recruitment process and length of tenure of the Chair and Vice-Chairs of the Advisory Committee following the recommendations of the Council-ACOM Working Group on the Strengthening of the Advisory Leadership (CAWGSAL) and the required changes to the Rules of Procedure.**

---

#### **Decisions at 2014 Council meeting**

In order to strengthen the Advisory leadership, both in the Advisory Committee (ACOM) and in the Secretariat, the 2014 Council Meeting approved the Bureau proposal ([CM 2014 Del-02b](#)) whereby:

- Within the Secretariat, the post of Head of the Advisory Programme (P5) was replaced by a Head of Advisory Support (Grade P3).

The Head of Advisory Support reports to the General Secretary and focus on: (a) managing the advisory resources (staff and finances) in the Secretariat; (b) maintaining the technical/scientific knowledge base; and (c) ensuring an effective and efficient secretariat support for ACOM.

It was decided that until the implementation of the full package in 2016, and to ensure an appropriate recruitment process, the Head of Advisory Support is a temporary position, recruited from within the Secretariat and during 2015 filled by Cristina Morgado.

- Within the ACOM leadership the position of ACOM chair was increased from 50% to 100% time, with a corresponding salary increase for this additional time commitment; to recognize the new strategic responsibilities;

It was decided that until the implementation of the full package in 2016, and to ensure an appropriate recruitment process, the current ACOM Chair, Eskild Kirkegaard continued with the new functions in a full time position, and his contract was adjusted to these new terms until the end of his three year term by the end of 2016.

- Within the ACOM leadership the salaries of each of the three Vice-Chairs was increased from 33% to 38% to better reflect the time commitments that they actually devote to their responsibilities.

## Update

A vacancy announcement for the Head of Advisory Support was issued in the beginning of August and with the aim to fill the position no later than the end of December 2015, for an initial period of four years. As was outlined in the Bureau proposal, and reiterated in the CAWGSAL report, the Head of Advisory Support reports to the General Secretary, with a secretariat driven open recruitment process and public vacancy announcement.

## CAWGSAL proposal and Bureau approval

At its meeting in February 2015 CAWGSAL detailed the division of tasks between the Head of Advisory Support, the ACOM Chair and the ACOM Vice-Chairs, and came up with proposals for recruitment processes and a suggestion for the length of their tenures.

### *Station of the ACOM Chair*

Given that the ACOM Chair is a full-time position, and based on the positive experience with the current ACOM Chair, CAWGSAL supported the proposal to station the ACOM Chair in the Secretariat (though remaining responsible to ACOM and Council). This was endorsed by Bureau.

### *Recruitment process:*

The following recruitment process was suggested by CAWGSAL for the ACOM Chair and endorsed by the June Bureau Meeting:

1. *The position of Chair of the ICES Advisory Committee should be advertised as widely as possible, on the ICES website and by notifying ICES Member Countries, stakeholders, and cooperation partners, and with a clear outline of the timeframe of the various stages of the recruitment process, as well as an indication of the expected start date. The General Secretary will compile the applications.*
2. *A recruitment panel will be established with the following membership: Three ACOM members selected by ACOM of which one is appointed by ACOM as chair of the panel, two members of Bureau selected by the Bureau, a SCICOM representative, the General Secretary, and the Head of Advisory Support. The outgoing Chair of ACOM cannot be appointed as member.*
3. *The applications will be reviewed by the recruitment panel and the panel will develop a short-list (based on certain criteria defined in the job description).*
4. *The Chair of the recruitment panel will present the shortlist to ACOM for further selection of up to three candidates to go further to a more formal interview with the recruitment panel (nominations).*
5. *Based on the interviews a priority ranking of candidates will be created by the recruitment panel, i.e., specifically stating that the listed candidates are qualified and recommended in priority order to do the job.*

6. Finally, Council appoints the ACOM Chair according to the priority ranking, and thus approving that the process has been carried out according to the established procedure. This ensures that if the first priority candidate decides not to take the position, the list of candidates in rank order may be followed to fill the position.

7. The position is for a three- year term, with a possibility for another three-year term (limit of two successive terms). The ACOM chair is subject to an evaluation process after one year, led by the President and Bureau. One year before the end of the three-year term a Bureau–ACOM panel consisting of 2 Bureau members and 2 ACOM members will evaluate if the contract of the ACOM Chair shall be extended for a further three years. They will provide a recommendation to Bureau, who will decide on the renewal.

#### *Length of tenure:*

Given that the candidate will now be expected to relocate to Copenhagen, and work out of the Secretariat, CAWGSAL proposed a three-year term with an option for another three- year term (limit of two successive terms). This was endorsed by Bureau.

Bureau recommended greater clarification about the renewal process, explicitly stating that Bureau will decide on the renewal, cf. the new point 7 above.

#### *ACOM Vice-Chairs*

CAWGSAL recommended, and Bureau endorsed that the ACOM Chair should be empowered to decide on the number and the necessary qualifications of the Vice-Chairs, given the budgetary restrictions and thus awaiting the outcome of the ICES Business Model and the Programming Budget.

#### *Proposed recruitment procedure:*

CAWGSAL proposed, and Bureau endorsed, that competent Vice-Chairs are identified by the ACOM Chair. This list of potential candidates is presented to ACOM. ACOM makes a recommendation to the Chair. Based on this selection Council appoints the Vice-Chairs. In case of proposals for a three-year prolongation, the ACOM Chair will put forward an evaluation to ACOM, for them to make a recommendation to the chair, and final appointment by Council.

#### *Length of tenures:*

CAWGSAL proposed, and Bureau supported, the possibility for a three-year prolongation. To deal with Vice-Chairs whose contracts are up for renewal and the pending Council decision on length of contracts, Bureau **advised** that current contracts shall be considered by an electronic approval procedure after the Council meeting.

#### *Cost and resource implications:*

The Secretariat informed the group that according to financial calculations, comparing 2014 to 2015, the strengthening of the advisory leadership, is close to cost neutral.

**Necessary changes to the Rules of Procedure following discussions at the CAWGSAL meeting and the June Bureau meeting (indicated with underline)**

Rule 30,

iii) The Chair and Vice-Chair(s) of the Advisory Committee shall be **nominated** by the Advisory Committee and **appointed** by the Council, according to the established procedure<sup>1</sup>. The Chair and Vice Chair(s) shall hold office for a term of three years, with the possibility of a three year extension, subject to approval by the Council. They shall assume office on the first day of January next following their election. They shall not be eligible for re-election for the immediately succeeding term.

iv) If, for any reason, the Chair of any Committee is unable to complete his/her term of office, or is temporarily unable to act, the President shall **nominate** an interim Chair who will serve for the remainder of the year, or for such shorter period as may be decided by the President. The Committee shall nominate a new Chair at the first opportunity, who will be appointed by Council. The interim Chair will be eligible for election as Chair.

## 2 Summary Report CAWGSAL

---

### ToRs condensed:

**ToR 1.** Job description for the ACOM chair.

**ToR 2.** Job description for a full time Head of ACOM Support.

**ToR 3.** To elaborate the impact of resource limitations in relation to the support provided by the ACOM Vice-Chairs.

**ToR 4.** To examine the cost and resource implications for ICES.

**ToR 5.** Examine the capacity within the ICES Secretariat to respond to requests for advice and ensure the science structures are capable of providing the necessary support.

### TOR 1, 2, and 3

#### Brainstorming: Division of responsibilities

To ensure the best possible support to ACOM a more strategic development of the advisory services the Council was agreed. The task was to identify and allocate the main responsibilities and elements of the Advisory Leadership of ICES, (i.e. ACOM Chair and Vice Chairs, Head of Advice, Advisory Department in the Secretariat) each with different responsibilities and tasks for the Advisory process. This should be achieved through a mobilization of secretariat resources; and a good supervision and control of the finances acquired from the advisory clients. In order to ensure that all workshop participants had the same idea about the allocation of responsibility between the ACOM Chair, Vice-Chairs, and Head of Advisory Support a brainstorming activity was undertaken. Using sentences from

---

<sup>1</sup> The recruitment procedure as agreed by Council in 2015.

past job descriptions and supporting papers the group assigned the following tasks and responsibilities:

### ACOM Chair

Key responsibilities	Key tasks
The strategic development of ICES advice in accordance with the ICES Strategic Plan.	Chairing meetings with ACOM, clients, cooperation partners, and expert group chairs.
Maintaining the horizontal (= between EGs) and the vertical (= between years) consistency of advice.	Report to Bureau and Council amongst others on the functioning of ACOM.
Promote and organize the integration of the advice in cooperation with SCICOM Chair	Represent ACOM in external meetings
Deciding on how to address special requests	Report to ACOM
Leading the Advice and overseeing the Advisory process in terms of technical quality, relevance, and integrity.	
Keeping contact to clients, cooperation partners and observers.	
Presenting the advice to clients and stakeholders	
Establishing a communication and feedback loop on errors in advice.	
Securing the active participation of ACOM in the process.	

### Vice-chairs

Key responsibilities	Key tasks
Overseeing the development of advice	Chairing and participating in a number of meetings: advice drafting

	groups, review groups, ACOM meetings, and other meetings
Support ACOM and ACOM Chair in all aspects	Maintain consistency of advice
	Present and explain the advice to stakeholders and cooperation partners

### Head of Advisory Support

The meeting was of the opinion that the title “Head of ACOM Support” is functionally appropriate but may be incomprehensible to the world outside of ICES. For this reason it felt that “Head of Advisory Support” is more appropriate. The meeting recognized that the responsibilities and work tasks of the Head of Advisory Support will be defined by the General Secretary based on the needs to support the ACOM Chair and the whole advisory system. The table of responsibilities and tasks should be seen as a description/recommendation.

Key responsibilities	Key tasks
Implementing the <b>work plan</b> for the advisory services  Plan and manage the <b>section budget</b> of the advisory services	Secure the consistency of the advice
Negotiation of <b>MoUs</b> with clients	Supervise the technical quality assurance for the advisory products
Negotiation and implementation of <b>special request</b>	Act as a liaison between ACOM and the Secretariat
Checking special requests on feasibility in terms of work capacity and content	Discuss feasibility and content of special requests with ACOM Chair
<b>Management of advisory staff</b> within the Secretariat	Coordinate public outreach (media enquiries/ACs and other stakeholders).
<b>Assist ACOM</b> in preparing ICES advice	Act as a member of the Secretariat management group.

### Recruitment procedure:

*CAWGSAL recommends the following procedure be implemented for the recruitment of the Chair of the ICES Advisory Committee:*

1. The position of Chair of the ICES Advisory Committee should be advertised as widely as possible, on the ICES website and by notifying ICES Member Countries, stakeholders, and cooperation partners, and with a clear outline of the timeframe of the various stages of the recruitment process, as well as an indication of the expected start date. The General Secretary will compile the applications.
2. A recruitment panel will be established with the following membership: Three ACOM members selected by ACOM of which one is appointed by ACOM as chair of the panel, two members of Bureau selected by the Bureau, the General Secretary and the Head of Advisory Support. The outgoing Chair of ACOM cannot be appointed as member.
3. The applications will be reviewed by the recruitment panel and the panel will develop a short-list (based on certain criteria defined in the job description).
4. The Chair of the recruitment panel will present the shortlist to ACOM for further selection of up to three candidates to go further to a more formal interview with the recruitment panel (nominations).
5. Based on the interviews a priority ranking of candidates will be created by the recruitment panel.
6. Finally, Council is informed about the priority ranking (and is not be asked to select a candidate), with the aim to oversee that the process has been carried out according to the established procedure. This ensures that if the first priority candidate decides not to take the position, the list of candidates in rank order may be followed to fill the position. The final selection of the candidate is approved by Council.

### **Length of contracts**

Given that the candidate will now be expected to relocate to Copenhagen, and work out of the Secretariat, a three-year term with an option for another three- year term (limit of two successive terms) was discussed as optimal.

Flexible contract options should continue, for instance, the potential for the future ACOM Chair to retain employment at his/her home institute, the salary just paid by ICES, thereby facilitating a return to work after the term as ACOM Chair.

The ACOM Chair should be subject to an evaluation process, led by the President and Bureau after one year. Six months before the end of the three-year term a Bureau–ACOM panel should evaluate if the contract of the ACOM Chair will be extended for a further three years.

### **The role of Vice–Chairs**

The ACOM Chair should be empowered to decide on the number and the necessary qualifications of the Vice-Chairs.

### **Proposed recruitment procedure:**

Competent people are identified by the ACOM Chair. This list of potential candidates is presented to ACOM. ACOM then makes a recommendation to the Chair. This selection shall finally be approved/supported by Council. The duration of the contracts are equally to the contract of the ACOM Chair 3 year with the option for the prolongation of another 3 years term. In case of proposals for a three-

year prolongation, the ACOM Chair will put forward an evaluation to ACOM, for them to make a recommendation to the chair, and final approval/support by Council.

**Action:** There are two Vice-Chairs contracts up for one-year renewal next year (2016) and this situation needs to be evaluated, in the light of the need for continuity. This was highlighted to Bureau in June.

## SCICOM

The group was of the opinion that a profound analysis of the functioning and role of SCICOM was needed, in particular with its role in contributing to the integrated assessment and advice.

**Recommendation:** CAWGSAL recommends that should Council decide to implement similar structural changes to ICES Science, similar recruitment procedures be adopted by the Science Committee.

### ToR 4: Consider the cost implications for ICES, and resource implications in the Secretariat

The workload in the Secretariat was addressed, and the new tools and streamlining of working procedures were pointed to, as a means to address some of the workload issues. At the same time it was emphasized that the development and taking into use of new tools/procedures are resource demanding.

If a more general line is followed, i.e., dividing the tasks between the Expert Working Groups (responsible for the development of science and methods) and the Secretariat (responsible for the application of the methods, as developed by the Expert Working Groups), the group considered that it is likely that a need for additional staff in the advisory department in the Secretariat would arise.

The Secretariat informed the group that according to financial calculations, comparing 2014 to 2015, the strengthening of the advisory leadership, is close to cost neutral.

### ToR 5 Capacity of the Secretariat

The meeting discussed the capacity of the ICES Secretariat to respond to requests for advice, noting the major components as:

- **Competencies necessary** to deal with current work, as well as to develop future strategic work, in accordance with the ICES Strategic Plan, 2014-2018.
- **Modern working tools**, to help facilitate the work of the experts, to ease and streamline the working procedures in the secretariat, as well as to free some resources for other tasks, both for assisting secretaries and for professional officers.
- **Assessment of working procedures within the Secretariat**, and what is needed to support ACOM in the provision of scientific sound advice on a regular basis (annual/biennial assessments and/or advice).
- **Employment of additional staff in the secretariat.**



The Secretariat recruitment procedures within the Advisory department have recently aimed at hiring people with a possibility to facilitate some of the scientific processes/advice deliverables, requiring scientific skills, rather than process management. This change is related to the expectation that support for the advisory process will need to become more technical, related to application of scientific methods, decided by ACOM and the Expert Working Groups.

It may be necessary to **evaluate if there is a mismatch** between the support that the EGs need and the current role of the Secretariat. In line with the recommendations from the External Advisory Review<sup>2</sup> (2012), the development of the Secretariat should be further explored to help address workload issues and provide greater support to the ICES network. The role of expert groups and the scientists should focus on science and methods.

The group was of the opinion that it was technically not in the position to comprehensively analyze the capacity of the Secretariat in relation to the expected workload. The group felt that within the Secretariat adaptations to the new set-up are needed and possible but must go hand-in hand with the further development of the RCT and CARA. In addition a transfer of routine assessment work from the EGs to the Secretariat is expected to be a gradual process also depending on the staff development within the advisory department.

Even though it was felt that the Secretariat is in a good position to face and cope with these changes, it cannot be ruled out that additional work coming into the Secretariat can eventually not be solely compensated by increased efficiency through CARA, the RCT and new staff in compensation for outgoing staff. In this case more staff would be need to be employed for the advisory department of the Secretariat.

---