

# ICES WGEVO REPORT 2012

SCICOM STEERING GROUP ON SUSTAINABLE USE OF ECOSYSTEMS (SSGSUE)

ICES CM 2012/SSGSUE:02

REF. SCICOM & ACOM

## Report of the Working Group on Fisheries-Induced Evolution (WGEVO)

1–4 May 2012

Bergen, Norway



ICES

International Council for  
the Exploration of the Sea

CIEM

Conseil International pour  
l'Exploration de la Mer

## **International Council for the Exploration of the Sea Conseil International pour l'Exploration de la Mer**

H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44–46  
DK-1553 Copenhagen V  
Denmark  
Telephone (+45) 33 38 67 00  
Telefax (+45) 33 93 42 15  
[www.ices.dk](http://www.ices.dk)  
[info@ices.dk](mailto:info@ices.dk)

Recommended format for purposes of citation:

ICES. 2012. Report of the Working Group on Fisheries-Induced Evolution (WGEVO), 1-4 May 2012, Bergen, Norway. ICES CM 2012/SSGSUE:02. 10 pp.  
<https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.pub.9084>

For permission to reproduce material from this publication, please apply to the General Secretary.

The document is a report of an Expert Group under the auspices of the International Council for the Exploration of the Sea and does not necessarily represent the views of the Council.

© 2012 International Council for the Exploration of the Sea

## Contents

---

Executive summary .....	1
1 Opening and closing of the meeting.....	2
2 Adoption of the agenda .....	2
3 Updates on new developments in FIE research .....	3
4 Working Group manuscripts.....	3
5 Computational tools for estimating selection differentials.....	5
6 Future of the Working Group.....	6
7 References .....	6
Annex 1: List of WGEVO Participants, Bergen, Norway, 7–11 May 2012 .....	7
Annex 2: Draft resolution for multi-annual ToRs .....	9



## Executive summary

---

The Working Group on Fisheries-induced Evolution (WGEVO) is a continuation of the Study Group on Fisheries Induced Adaptive Change (SGFIAC) that started in 2007 and has set the agenda on this research topic within ICES. The Working Group's 2012 meeting focused on (i) updates on new developments in research on fisheries-induced evolution (FIE); (ii) two manuscripts initiated during the group's 2008 meeting and jointly prepared by the group's members intersessionally, one on *Evolutionary Impact Assessments* (EvoIAs) and the other on the influence of FIE on reference points for fisheries management; (iii) developing simple tools for estimating, from commonly available data, fisheries-induced selection differentials; and (iv) applying these tools to key life-history traits in a range of important stocks.

Related to (ii), the following WGEVO-prepared article is now in press: Laugen A.T., Engelhard G.H., Whitlock R., Arlinghaus R., Dankel D.J., Dunlop E.S., Eikeset A.M., Enberg K., Jørgensen C., Matsumura S., Nusslé S., Urbach D., Baulier L., Boukal D.S., Ernande B., Johnston F.D., Mollet F., Pardoe H., Therkildsen N.O., Uusi-Heikkilä S., Vainikka A., Heino M., Rijnsdorp A.D. and Dieckmann U. (2012). **Evolutionary impact assessment: Accounting for evolutionary consequences of fishing in an ecosystem approach to fisheries management.** *Fish and Fisheries*, in press.

## 1 Opening and closing of the meeting

---

The Chairs opened the meeting on Tuesday, 1 May, at 09.00 and closed it on Friday, 4 May, at 18.00. The meeting was held at the Institute of Marine Research in Bergen, Norway.

## 2 Adoption of the agenda

---

The Terms of Reference for the Working Group on Fisheries-Induced Evolution (WGEVO) are listed below:

- a) Provide a forum for international collaboration and exchange of emerging scientific insights on fisheries-induced adaptive changes;
- b) Assemble and review empirical evidence of fisheries-induced adaptive change and its consequences for the conservation of biodiversity and sustainable exploitation of marine species within an ecosystem context;
- c) Develop the Evolutionary Impact Assessment framework and apply it to the specific challenges arising from fisheries-induced adaptive change and its consequences, including the following subtasks:
  - i) Evaluate the impact of existing management measures and tools, such as minimum mesh and landing sizes, precautionary reference points, marine protected areas, and effort regulations, on fisheries-induced adaptive change;
  - ii) Relate consequences of fisheries-induced adaptive change to stakeholder utilities and to current management objectives and evaluate possible more specific objectives for managing fisheries-induced adaptive change;
- d) Develop scientific and methodological tools to monitor and respond appropriately to risks to biodiversity and sustainable exploitation posed by fisheries-induced adaptive change, with a particular emphasis on making these tools readily available for a broader range of scientists and managers.

WGEVO will report by 10 June 2012 (via SSGSUE) for the attention of SCICOM and ACOM.

During this meeting, work on fisheries-induced evolution (FIE) was organized in three parts:

- Updates on new developments in FIE research.
- Final discussions on two WGEVO-prepared manuscripts titled *“Evolutionary impact assessment: Accounting for evolutionary consequences of fishing in an ecosystem approach to fisheries management”* and *“Can fisheries-induced evolution shift reference points for fisheries management?”*.
- Development of computational tools (R scripts) for estimating fisheries-induced selection differentials in exploited stocks, and application of these scripts to the comparison of the thus-estimated fisheries-induced selection differentials among a wide range of exploited stocks.

The corresponding developments are described in Sections 3 to 5 below.

### 3 Updates on new developments in FIE research

---

During this meeting, six presentations were given on new research developments related to FIE. The title and co-authors are listed below, with the name of the presenter being underlined:

- Boukal D.S., Dieckmann U., Enberg K., Heino M., Jørgensen C. Versatile growth model for fish reveals the importance of getting reproductive investment right: life-history implications of allometric scaling relationships.
- Devine J., Heino M. Investigating the drivers of maturation dynamics in Barents Sea haddock (Devine and Heino, 2011).
- Díaz Pauli B., Utne Palm A.C., Reznick D., Heino M. Experimental evidence of fisheries-induced evolution? The guppy experiment.
- Heino M., Johansen T., Edvardsen R.B., Furmanec T., Torrison O. Genomic signature of fisheries-induced evolution in Northeast arctic cod?
- Rijnsdorp A.D., van Overzee H., Poos J.J. Ecological and economic trade-offs in the management of mixed fisheries: A case study of spawning closures in flatfish fisheries (Rijnsdorp et al. 2012)
- Vainikka A., Niemelä P., Kortet R. Theory of fishing-induced evolution of animal personality.

### 4 Working Group manuscripts

---

The work initiated by the Study Group on Fisheries Induced Adaptive Change (SGFIAC), to develop a framework for evolutionary impact assessment, has resulted in the manuscript *“Evolutionary impact assessment: Accounting for evolutionary consequences of fishing in an ecosystem approach to fisheries management”*, which was submitted to *Fish and Fisheries* in autumn 2011. During the present Working Group meeting, the comments of the reviewers were discussed and the final manuscript was prepared. In July 2012, this manuscript has been accepted for publication in *Fish and Fisheries* (Laugen *et al.*, 2012). The manuscript describes an evolutionary impact assessment (EvoIA) as a structured approach for assessing the evolutionary consequences of fishing and for evaluating the merits of alternative management options. EvoIA will (i) contribute to the ecosystem approach to fisheries management by clarifying how evolution alters stock properties and ecological relations, (ii) support the precautionary approach to fisheries management by addressing a previously overlooked source of uncertainty and risk, and (iii) help realize the Johannesburg summit’s commitment to the restoration of sustain-able fisheries.

At its meeting in 2008, the Study Group initiated a second joint manuscript project on the effects of FIE on reference points for fisheries management. The manuscript *“Can fisheries-induced evolution shift reference points for fisheries management?”* (Heino *et al.*, in preparation) takes its point of departure from the observation that fisheries-management reference points are not static, but may change when a population’s environment is changing or when the population itself is changing. Fisheries-induced evolution is one mechanism that can drive changes in population characteristics, leading to “shifting” reference points through two possible pathways: by changing the underlying biological processes and by leading to changes in the perception of a system. The former implies that “true” reference points are changing, whereas the latter implies that the yardstick used to quantify a system’s status is changing. Unac-

counted shifting of either kind means that reference points gradually lose their intended meaning. This can lead to increased precaution, which is safe, but may be costly. Shifting can also occur in the direction of danger, such that actual risks are higher than accepted. The qualitative analysis presented in the manuscript suggests that all commonly used reference points are susceptible to shifting through fisheries-induced evolution, including the widely used limit and precautionary reference points for spawning-stock biomass ( $B_{lim}$  and  $B_{pa}$ ) and fishing mortality ( $F_{lim}$  and  $F_{pa}$ ). These findings call for increased awareness of fisheries-induced evolution and highlight the value of specifying reference points based on adequately updated information, to capture changes in the biological processes that drive fish population dynamics. The Working Group discussed the manuscript and the comments were used to update the manuscript, which is now being circulated for final consolidation. Submission to the *ICES Journal of Marine Science* is foreseen within the next month.

The Working Group further discussed the idea to produce a publication on FIE targeted at a wider scientific audience and the general public, ideally co-produced by ICES. It was agreed that the Working Group chairs will contact ICES to discuss the options for such a publication.



## 5 Computational tools for estimating selection differentials

---

The work on the estimation of selection differentials, started in 2010, has been continued during the present meeting. The estimation of selection differentials from data on life-history traits (growth, maturation, and reproduction) and exploitation patterns (fishing mortality by age/length class), which are readily available for many stocks; allow fisheries scientists and managers to anticipate the direction of FIE and to assess the evolutionary vulnerability of specific traits and stocks to fishing.

During the meeting, the R scripts made available by Shuichi Matsumura and Mikko Heino have been further developed to improve their performance and to make them more generic. Based on the Working Group's testing of these scripts, using data from a number of ICES stocks, the scripts will be made available to all WGEVO members, with the goal of applying these tools to a range of important stocks. The eventual product of this project will be a WGEVO-prepared manuscript, envisaged again to be written with suitable collective authorship.

More specifically, the work during the meeting was focused on the following tasks:

- Improving the script for estimating selection differentials, in particular to allow for a separate spawner fishery and for using non-horizontal probabilistic maturation reaction norms.
- Improving the parameter-estimation script, in particular to allow for the estimation of non-horizontal probabilistic maturation reaction norms.
- Updating and revising estimations of model parameters and selection differentials reported in ICES (2011) for the following stocks:
  - Western Channel sole
  - North Sea sole
  - North Sea plaice
  - North Sea turbot
  - North Sea brill
  - North Sea herring
- Estimating model parameters for the following new stocks:
  - Barents Sea haddock
  - Norwegian spring-spawning herring
  - East Baltic Sea cod
  - West Baltic Sea cod
  - North Sea cod
  - North Sea haddock
  - North Sea whiting
  - North Sea Norway pout
  - Lake Takvatn (Norway) Arctic charr
  - Lake Stuurajavri (Norway) whitefish
  - Wisconsin (USA) walleye
- Discussing further stocks to be included in this study.

## 6 Future of the Working Group

---

The Working Group recognized that good progress in addressing the terms of reference has been made and that significant challenges in bridging the gap towards the evolutionarily informed management of concrete fish stocks remain. The current terms of reference are an adequate reflection of the ambitions of the group and are clearly linked with the science plan of ICES, in particular with the two thematic themes “*Impacts of fishing on marine ecosystems*” and “*Development of options for sustainable use of ecosystems*”.

## 7 References

---

- Devine, J., Heino, M. 2011. Investigating the drivers of maturation dynamics in Barents Sea haddock (*Melanogrammus aeglefinus*). *Fisheries Research* 110: 441–449.
- ICES. 2011. Report of the Working Group on Fisheries-Induced Evolution (WGEVO), 3–5 May 2011, ICES Headquarters, Copenhagen. ICES Document CM 2011/SSGSUE:04. ICES, Copenhagen. 12 pp.
- Heino, M., Baulier, L., Boukal, D. S., Ernande, B., Johnston, F. D., Mollet, F., Pardoe, H., Therkildsen, N. O., Uusi-Heikkilä, S., Vainikka, A., Arlinghaus, R., Dankel, D. J., Dunlop, E. S., Eikeset, A. M., Enberg, K., Engelhard, G. H., Jørgensen, C., Laugen, A. T., Matsumura, S., Nusslé, S., Urbach, D., Whitlock, R., Rijnsdorp, A. D., Dieckmann, U. (in preparation). Can fisheries-induced evolution shift reference points for fisheries management?
- Laugen, A. T., Engelhard, G. H., Whitlock, R., Arlinghaus, R., Dankel, D. J., Dunlop, E. S., Eikeset, A. M., Enberg, K., Jørgensen, C., Matsumura, S., Nusslé, S., Urbach, D., Baulier, L., Boukal, D. S., Ernande, B., Johnston, F. D., Mollet, F., Pardoe, H., Therkildsen, N. O., Uusi-Heikkilä, S., Vainikka, A., Heino, M., Rijnsdorp, A. D., Dieckmann, U. 2012. Evolutionary impact assessment: Accounting for evolutionary consequences of fishing in an ecosystem approach to fisheries management. *Fish and Fisheries*, in press.
- Rijnsdorp, A. D., van Overzee, H., Poos, J. J. 2012. Ecological and economic trade-offs in the management of mixed fisheries: a case study of spawning closures in flatfish fisheries. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 447: 179–194.

## Annex 1: List of WGEVO Participants, Bergen, Norway, 1–4 May 2012

NAME	ADDRESS	TELEPHONE/FAX	E-MAIL
Ulf Dieckmann <b>Chair</b>	International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis Schlossplatz 1 2361 Laxenburg Austria	+43 22 36 807 386	dieckmann@iiasa.ac.at
Mikko Heino <b>Chair</b>	University of Bergen EvoFish PO Box 7800 N-5020 Bergen Norway	+47 55 23 6962 +47 55 23 8687	mikko.heino@imr.no
Adriaan Rijnsdorp <b>Chair</b>	Wageningen IMARES PO Box 68 1970 AB IJmuiden Netherlands	31 317 48 7191 31 317 487326	Adriaan.Rijnsdorp@wur.nl
Asbjørn Christensen	DTU Aqua - National Institute of Aquatic Resources Section for Fisheries Advice Charlottenlund Slot Jægersborg Alle 1 2920 Charlottenlund Denmark	+45 3396 3373	asc@aqua.dtu.dk
Dorothy Dankel	Institute of Marine Research Nordnes PO Box 1870 5817 Bergen Norway	+47 55 23 85 56 +47 55 23 86 87	dorothy.dankel@imr.no
Katja Enberg	Institute of Marine Research Nordnes PO Box 1870 5817 Bergen Norway	+47 410 06368 +47 5558 4246	katja.enberg@imr.no
Bruno Ernande	Ifremer Port-en-Bessin Station Avenue du Général De Gaulle PO Box 32 F-14520 Port-en-Bessin France	+ 33 (0)2 31515642 + 33 (0)2315156 01	Bruno.Ernande@ifremer.fr
Ane Laugen	Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences Department of Ecology PO Box 7044 SE-750 07 Uppsala Sweden	+46 18 67 23 57	Ane.laugen@ekol.slu.se

NAME	ADDRESS	TELEPHONE/FAX	E-MAIL
Shuichi Matsumura	Gifu University Faculty of Applied Biological Sciences 1-1 Yanagido 501-1193 Gifu City Japan	+81 58 293 2874	matsumur@gifu-u.ac.jp
Raul Primicerio	University of Tromsø Faculty of Biosciences, Fisheries and Economics Breivika N-9037 Tromsø Norway	+47 776 45549	raul.Primicerio@uit.no
Anssi Vainikka	University of Oulu Department of Biology 3000 FI-90014 University of Oulu Finland	+358 8 553 1219 +358 8 553 1061	anssi.vainikka@oulu.fi

## Annex 2: Draft resolution for multi-annual ToRs

The **Working Group on Fisheries-Induced Evolution** (WGEVO), chaired by Mikko Heino, Norway, Ulf Dieckmann, Austria, and Adriaan D. Rijnsdorp, The Netherlands, will meet in Copenhagen during 7–11 May 2013, to work on ToRs and generate deliverables as listed in the table below.

WGEVO will report on the activities of 2013 (the working group's first year) by 31 July 2013 for the attention of SSGSUE.

### ToR descriptors<sup>1</sup>

ToR	DESCRIPTION	BACKGROUND	SCIENCE PLAN	DURATION	EXPECTED DELIVERABLES
			TOPICS ADDRESSED		
a	Provide a forum for international collaboration and exchange of emerging scientific insights on fisheries-induced adaptive changes. The activities of WGEVO will provide ICES with a basis for advice on whether and how the effects of fisheries-induced adaptive change need to be taken into account in ecosystem approach to management.	The ecosystem approach to management is the overarching motive for ICES science and management.	121, 141, 143, 211, 311, 312, 314, 344, 345, 346	Years 1, 2, 3	
b	Assemble and review empirical evidence of fisheries-induced adaptive change and its consequences for the conservation of biodiversity and sustainable exploitation of marine species within an ecosystem context.	a) Research beyond current Science Plan requirements b) Research for MSFD and GES requirements c) No requirements from other EGs	141, 143, 311, 312, 344	Years 1, 2	ICES publication for general audience, Wikipedia article
c	Apply the Evolutionary Impact Assessment framework to specific case studies to: (i) evaluate the impact of existing management measures on fisheries-induced adaptive change; (ii) relate consequences of fisheries-induced adaptive change to stakeholder utilities and to current management objectives; (iii) evaluate possible more specific objectives for managing fisheries-induced adaptive change.	a) Research beyond current Science Plan requirements b) Research for MSFD and GES requirements c) Links with relevant Assessment WGs required	211, 311, 312, 314, 344, 345	Years 1, 2, 3	Peer-reviewed publications

<sup>1</sup> Avoid generic terms such as "Discuss" or "Consider". Aim at drafting specific and clear ToR, the delivery of which can be assessed

d	Develop scientific and methodological tools to monitor and respond appropriately to risks to biodiversity and sustainable exploitation posed by fisheries-induced adaptive change, with a particular emphasis on making these tools readily available for a broader range of scientists and managers.	a) Research beyond current Science Plan requirements b) Research for MSFD and GES requirements c) Links with relevant Assessment WGs required	121, 141, 143, 311	Years 1,2	Tools (R-scripts), potentially accompanied by peer-reviewed publications, as the need might arise
---	---	---	--------------------	-----------	---

### Summary of multi-annual work plan

YEAR	MAIN DELIVERABLE
Year 1	ICES document providing an overview of FIE for a wider scientific audience and the general public; R-scripts for estimating selection differentials of exploited fish stocks
Year 2	Review of selection differentials of exploited fish stocks
Year 3	Evolutionary Impact Assessment (EvoIA) of a selected case study

### Supporting information

Priority	The activities of the Working Group on Fisheries-induced Evolution will provide ICES with a basis for advice on whether and how the effects of fisheries-induced adaptive change need to be taken into account in future management. Such advice is needed in relation with the precautionary approach, the ecosystem approach, biodiversity conservation, and the evaluation of risk and uncertainty.
Resource requirements	The research activities providing input to WGEVO are ongoing, and corresponding resources have been committed by the engaged institutions. The administrative resources for convening the annual WGEVO meeting are negligible.
Participants	WGEVO is normally attended by 10–20 members and guests.
Secretariat facilities	None.
Financial	No financial implications.
Linkages to ACOM and groups under ACOM	There are no obvious direct linkages.
Linkages to other committee or groups	ACOM and relevant Assessment WGs.
Linkages to other organizations	None.