

ACOM SEPTEMBER 2016

ICES ADVISORY COMMITTEE COMMITTEE

ICES CM 2016/ACOM:1

Minutes of the ACOM Consultations

18 September 2016

Riga, Latvia



ICES
CIEM

International Council for
the Exploration of the Sea

Conseil International pour
l'Exploration de la Mer

International Council for the Exploration of the Sea Conseil International pour l'Exploration de la Mer

H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44–46
DK-1553 Copenhagen V
Denmark
Telephone (+45) 33 38 67 00
Telefax (+45) 33 93 42 15
www.ices.dk
info@ices.dk

Recommended format for purposes of citation:

ICES. 2017. Minutes of the ACOM Consultations, 18 September 2016, Riga, Latvia.
ICES CM 2016/ACOM:1. 18 pp. <https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.pub.8311>

For permission to reproduce material from this publication, please apply to the General Secretary.

The document is a report of an Expert Group under the auspices of the International Council for the Exploration of the Sea and does not necessarily represent the views of the Council.

© 2016 International Council for the Exploration of the Sea

Contents

1	Welcome	3
2	Adoption of agenda.....	3
3	Review of 2016 and ACOM workplan 2016 – progress report.....	3
4	Advisory workplan for the remainder of 2016	3
5	Advisory workplan for 2017	5
6	Workplan for Advice requested for delivery in 2017	5
6.1	Benchmarks 2017	5
6.2	Benchmarks 2018	5
7	Role of the Secretariat in stock assessments.....	6
8	Non-fisheries advice (Doc 7a and 7b)	6
9	Technical guidelines (Doc 8)	6
10	ACOM Chair Recruitment Process Update	7
11	AOB.....	7
11.1	ACOM member of ASC Award Selection Group.....	7
11.2	Early career scientist bus stop	7

Welcome

The participants were welcomed to the meeting by ACOM Chair Eskild Kirkegaard. A special welcome was made to Edwin van Helmond, new ACOM alternate from the Netherlands and Gudmundur Thordarson, new Icelandic ACOM member, who both attended the ACOM meeting for the first time. The Chair also informed that due to flight cancellations the German ACOM Member, Christopher Zimmermann, and the German ACOM Alternate, Alexander Kempf, were unable to attend the meeting.

It was emphasized that the ACOM Consultation meeting is not an official meeting and therefore no decisions can be taken at the meeting. Those will be taken afterwards at the ACOM Forum and at the ACOM meeting in November.

1 Adoption of agenda

The agenda was presented by the Chair and approved with no additional items added.

2 Review of 2016 and ACOM workplan 2016 – progress report

Meeting Document 2, Chair's report to ACOM, contained some preliminary observations on the advisory process in 2016 and a short progress report. The ACOM was invited to discuss the observations with the aim of identifying issues which will require follow up and to discuss in general the progress report.

It was communicated that Advisory Councils are interested in drawing on ICES in developing proposal for management plans and in finding solutions to management problems: Currently not part of our MoU with the EU, though some members felt that such interaction would be useful. The ACOM leadership agreed, but pointed out that this was ultimately a Council decision, and costs (who pays, and how much) would factor into any decision. On this matter it was noted that it is still not clear how the ICES would interact with Regional management bodies under the CFP.

Participants were asked if more regular (e.g. quarterly) reports were wanted or if this would be too much information. It was felt that the September meeting report was useful since the majority of advice had been issued by then, but there was no disagreement to receiving more frequent reports.

3 Advisory workplan for the remainder of 2016

An overview was provided for the rest of 2016 advisory workplan with reference to [“Doc 04 Advisory workplan for the remainder of 2016”](#). ACOM was encouraged to nominate experts to ADGs.

It was noted that the “11 November, Advice on North Sea haddock and North Sea mixed fisheries advice, EU and Norway” process was still missing from the overview document and would be added.

It was noted that there was a chair clash for two processes (reopening of advice and WKSAM). An alternate chair would be identified.

It was noted that there was no up-to-date overview of nominations required by ACOM. The Secretariat would provide an overview document that would be uploaded to the ACOM forum in the upcoming days.

It was questioned what the planned process to address the DG MARE request on changes in fish distribution is. ACOM was informed that the planned release date will be in 2017. WGECO 2016 established the criteria on changes in distribution and now the ICES data center is analyzing the survey data. A workshop, WKFISHDISH, will be organized in November 2016, followed by an RG and ADG with release in early 2017 (February). ToRs for WKFISHDISH will soon be posted in the Resolution Forum.

Fisheries overviews:

For the fisheries overviews the Chair stressed that much of the information required had been compiled, however the text is largely still missing for all ecoregions. ACOM chair queried ACOM if the committee should still try to release all FO's or just a few that are currently at a more advanced stage. In both cases, there is a need for commitment from ACOM to provide text and key experts. ICES fisheries overviews are a key step forward to move away from single fish stock advice and going towards the ecosystem approach based advice.

ACOM members were optimistic about pushing forward in 2016, given the good experience/feedback from the ecosystem overviews. In practice resources may be hard to secure for the rest of 2016 in member countries that have allocated resources to other ongoing tasks (DCF-related).

Some delegates expressed their concern that their national expert group members dealing with single stock assessment that may have oversight to provide text suited as an "overview" also may dive into too much detail if requested to provide text.

Several members recommended that the work of drafting the fisheries overviews should this year go ahead with only a couple of ecoregions, by trying to cover all ecoregions we would run risk of not getting any fisheries overviews ready at a sufficient quality level to be released.

The secretariat lead on the fisheries overviews also reminded ACOM that for some ecoregions both the spatial distribution and fishing abrasion maps may not be possible to present as it is dependent on submission of VMS/logbook data.

The chair of ADGFO suggested that in order to get the required text key persons instead of working groups should be targeted. This would require identifying these persons to conduct an adequate quality check.

Some ACOM members expressed that the overview of management measures may not be the best element to include in the overviews. It was however, highlighted by the fisheries overviews ADG Chair that the end product will not be bibles but should provide overviews. Therefore a "management measures" section would be required.

The ACOM Chair concluded that based on discussions, the fisheries overviews this year would focus on a few selected ecoregions and that ACOM would be informed on the follow up actions

4 Advisory workplan for 2017

Head of Advisory Support (HoAS) presented an overview document on EGs in 2017 requiring nomination of chairs - as highlighted in "[Doc 05a1 ACOM Working Group Chairs](#)". Chairmanship is required for WGCSE (Working group on the Celtic Sea Ecosystem),.

ACOM approved the nominations made for EG chairs, and the relevant ACOM members will try to identify a suitable chair for the WGCSE.

5 Workplan for Advice requested for delivery in 2017

HoAS presented an overview document of 2017 advisory processes requiring nominations "[Doc 05a2 2017 advisory processes](#)" by ACOM members to ensure that planned ADGs will have the required expertise in 2017.

ACOM members highlighted the challenge they faced with consecutive similar themed meetings that force the most well suited expert to have to choose one over the other.

ACOM Chair drew attention to that 30 special request a year requires almost one ADG per week. The HoAS also emphasized that several criteria (e.g. meeting not starting on Monday, to allow chairs to prepare in advance of meetings) are taken into consideration when arranging the workplan and processes. Importantly, the planning need to also accommodate for the chairs and key experts availability.

ACOM Chair suggested that an alternative would be to organize three periods in the year to work through special request ADGs, one in early spring, one late spring and a third one in autumn. This would allow yearly advisory process planning to be streamlined around these time slots.

The ACOM Chair reminded the meeting that further discussion around this topic could be addressed in the afternoon subgroups.

HoAS reminded ACOM delegates that a link to the draft resolutions for expert groups was available on the ACOM page under ACOM links - "[resolutions](#)". ACOM was requested to revise and approve the resolution by 7th October 2016.

5.1 Benchmarks 2017

HoAS presented a document prepared by the Secretariat (Document 05b Benchmarks 2017) detailing the issue lists and chairs. Additional ToRs will be discussed and agreed in WCResolutions on 7th October.

5.2 Benchmarks 2018

HoAS presented a document prepared by the Secretariat (Document 05c Benchmarks 2018) detailing the issue lists and chairs. It was noted that witch flounder needs to be added to the original list.

6 Role of the Secretariat in stock assessments

ACOM have had a number of discussions on the need to reduce the workload of the EGs and to have some of the assessment work conducted by the secretariat. Related to this the Council agreed at its meeting in October 2015 to support the transition to a more cost-efficient use of resources in the advisory system (deliver the same, with less resources) and approved two P2 positions.

HoAS presented two positive and two negative issues that the secretariat has encountered in their recent work. Two negative issues were the difficulties of finding reviewers and the increasing workload. The ACOM chair suggested that providing a standard honorarium may help getting reviews.

HoAS mentioned that a positive aspect has been the recently developed tools, the stock assessment graphs and the stock list data base. Similarly, the successful involvement of secretariat staff in supporting stock assessment and advice drafting.

7 Non-fisheries advice

ACOM was presented with the challenge of non-fisheries advice with the specific example of WKCULEF and the associated advice on aquaculture as well as the comments from WGAQUA on the ICES advisory framework. Three sub-groups spent 1.5 hours discussing how ACOM work is coordinated in their country, how to improve ACOM's response to non-fisheries advice, and any specific feedback on WGAQUA's proposal for a separate advisory process to address requests for advice on aquaculture issues.

After a very good discussion it was agreed that ACOM will work harder at improving the composition of ACOM (including members, alternates and nominees) to better respond to non-fisheries advice. How this will be accomplished is left to the member countries. It should be noted that ICES communication on this issue should include national delegates as ACOM members usually do not control budgets or human resources.

Regarding WGAQUA's proposal ACOM concluded that integration is ICES goal, and separation, as WGAQUA suggests, will not facilitate this. That said, WGAQUA has done a good job with their proposal, emphasizing peer review and transparency. ACOM and WGAQUA have the same goals for robustness, etc. ACOM agreed that there is a need to improve but no need to change the system.

8 Technical guidelines

HoAS presented status document on the technical guidelines table of content (Document 8 Status report on progress of the Technical Guidelines)

The guidelines will be published as a separate *Advice book*. ACOM is invited to revise and comment the draft guidelines on SharePoint. The drafts will be posted on the ACOM forum once finalized.

9 ACOM Chair Recruitment Process Update

The chair of the recruitment panel, Maurice Clark, explained the recruitment procedure. He informed that ICES had received 10 applications and that the recruitment panel agreed on a shortlist of two candidates who will be invited for interviews. ACOM will be informed about the shortlisted candidates after the candidate's approval of sharing their applications with ACOM. The chair of the recruitment panel informed that according to clause 4 of the recruitment procedures, ACOM could nominate additional 3 candidates. The secretariat will provide additional information shortly after the ACOM Consultations meetings.

10 AOB

10.1 ACOM member of ASC Award Selection Group

Francisco Velasco volunteered to be the ACOM member of the ASC Award Selection Group

10.2 Early career scientist bus stop

For the early career scientist bus stop at the ASC Welcome reception on 19 September the following ACOM members volunteered to be available for answering questions: Larry Alade, Nick Bailey, Ghislain Chouinard, Carmen Fernandez, Harald Gjørseter, Eskild Kirkegaard, Joanne Morgan, Carl O'Brien, Mark Tasker, Francisco Velasco

Annex 1 List of participants

Name		Address	Email
Eskild Kirkegaard	ACOM Chair	International Council for the Exploration of the Sea H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44-46 1553 Copenhagen V Denmark	Eskild.kirkegaard@ices.dk
Ghislain Chouinard	ACOM Vice-chair	International Council for the Exploration of the Sea H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44-46 1553 Copenhagen V Denmark	Ghislain.Chouinard@ices.dk
Carmen Fernandez	ACOM Vice-Chair and BSG Co-Chair	International Council for the Exploration of the Sea H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44-46 1553 Copenhagen V Denmark Phone +34 (620) 588 360	Carmen.Fernandez@ices.dk
Mark Tasker	ACOM Vice-Chair	International Council for the Exploration of the Sea H. C. Andersens Boulevard 44-46 1553 Copenhagen V Denmark	mark@ices.dk

Larry Alade	ACOM member	University of Massachusetts Dartmouth Department of Fisheries Oceanography Woods Hole Laboratory Woods Hole MA 02543 United States Phone +1 508-495-2085 Fax +1 508-495-2393	larry.alade@noaa.gov
-------------	-------------	---	--

Robert Aps	ACOM member	Estonian Marine Institute University of Tartu 14 Mäealuse Street 12618 Tallinn Estonia	robert.aps@ut.ee
Alain Biseau	ACOM member	Ifremer Lorient Station 8, rue François Toullec 56100 Lorient France Phone +33 297 87 38 20 / +33 6 77 02 722 7 Fax +33 297 87 38 01	abiseau@ifremer.fr
Nick Bailey	ACOM member	Marine Scotland Science Marine Laboratory 375 Victoria Road Aberdeen AB11 9DB United Kingdom	nick.bailey@scotland.gsi.gov.uk
Michele Casini	ACOM alternate	Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences Institute of Marine Research Turistgatan 5 453 30 Lysekil Sweden Phone +46 523 18 750 / 700 Fax +46 523 13977	michele.casini@slu.se
Maurice Clarke	ACOM member	Marine Institute Rinville Oranmore Co. Galway Ireland Phone +353 91387200 Fax +353 91387201	maurice.clarke@marine.ie
Yuri Efimov	ACOM member	Russian Federal Research Institute of Fisheries & Oceanography (VNIRO) 17 Verkhne Krasnoselskaya 107140 Moscow Russian Federation Phone +7 499 264 9129 Fax +7 499 264 9129	efimov@vniro.ru

Harald Gjøsaeter	ACOM member	Institute of Marine Research P.O. Box 1870 Nordnes 5817 Bergen Norway Phone +47 55 238417 / mob +47 414 79 177 Fax +47 55 238687	Harald.Gjoesaeter@imr.no
Cornelius Hammer	ICES President	Thünen Institute Baltic Sea Fisheries Alter Hafen Süd 2 18069 Rostock Germany	cornelius.hammer@thuenen.de
Joanne Morgan	ACOM member	Fisheries and Oceans Canada DFO Science Branch PO Box 566 St John s NL A1C 5X1 Canada Phone +1 (709) 772-2261	Joanne.Morgan@dfo-mpo.gc.ca
Carl O'Brien	Delegate	Centre for Environment, Fisheries and Aquaculture Science (Cefas) Lowestoft Laboratory Pakefield Road NR33 0HT Lowestoft Suffolk United Kingdom Phone +44 1502 524256 / +44 7786800193 Fax +44 1502 527739	carl.obrien@cefas.co.uk
Jákup Reinert	The Faroe Islands observer	Faroe Marine Research Institute P.O. Box 3051 110 Tórshavn Faroe Islands Phone +298 35 353935 Fax +298 353901	jakupr@hav.fo
Matti Salminen	ACOM member	Natural Resources Institute Finland Natural resources and bioproduction Viikinkaari 4 00791 Helsinki Finland	Matti.Salminen@luke.fi

Nathalie Steins	ACOM member	Wageningen IMARES P.O. Box 68 1970 AB IJmuiden Netherlands	nathalie.steins@wur.nl
Gudmundur Thordarson	ACOM member	Marine Research Institute PO Box 1390 121 Reykjavík Iceland Phone +354 575 2000 Fax +354 575 2001	gudthor@hafro.is
Didzis Ustups	ACOM member	Institute of Food Safety, Animal Health and Environment (BIOR) 8 Daugavgrivas Str. Fish Resources Research Department 1048 Riga Latvia Phone +371 67610766	Didzis.Ustups@bior.gov.lv
Francisco Velasco	ACOM member	Instituto Español de Oceanografía Centro Oceanográfico de Santander P.O. Box 240 39004 Santander Cantabria Spain Phone +34 942 291060 Fax +34 942 275072	francisco.velasco@st.ieo.es
Edwin van Helmond	ACOM alternate	Wageningen IMARES P.O. Box 68 1970 AB IJmuiden Netherlands	edwin.vanhelmond@wur.nl
Morten Vinther	ACOM member	DTU Aqua - National Institute of Aquatic Resources Section for Fisheries Advice Charlottenlund Slot Jægersborg Alle 1 2920 Charlottenlund Denmark Phone +45 3588 33 50 Fax +45 3588 33 33	mv@aqua.dtu.dk

Anne Christine Brusendorff	ICES Secretariat	anne.christine@ices.dk
Anne Cooper	ICES Secretariat	anne.cooper@ices.dk
Scott Large	ICES Secretariat	scott.large@ices.dk
Inigo Martinez	ICES Secretariat	inigo@ices.dk
Arni Magnusson	ICES Secretariat	arni.magnusson@ices.dk
Colin Milar	ICES Secretariat	colin.millar@ices.dk
David Miller	ICES Secretariat	david.miller@ices.dk
Cristina Morgado	ICES Secretariat	cristina.morgado@ices.dk
Michala Ovens	ICES Secretariat	michala.ovens@ices.dk
Sebastian Valanko	ICES Secretariat	sebastian.valanko@ices.dk

Annex 2 – Draft Agenda

Draft Agenda

Welcome

- 1) Adoption of agenda (Doc 01).
- 2) Review of 2016 (Doc 2).

Doc 2 contains some preliminary observations on the advisory process in 2016. The ACOM is invited to discuss the observations with the aim of identifying issues which will require follow up. The relative poor ACOM involvement in non-fisheries advice is addressed under agenda item 7.

- 3) ACOM workplan 2016 – progress report (Doc 2)

Doc 2 includes a short progress report. ACOM is invited to discussion of the progress report.

- 4) Advisory workplan for the remainder of 2016 (link).

ACOM is invited to comment on the workplan for the advisory work for the remaining of 2016

- 5) Advisory workplan for 2017

- a) Workplan for Advice requested for delivery in 2017 – Expert Groups, Review, Advice drafting and Adoption of Advice. (link)
- b) Benchmarks 2017 (Docs 5b Benchmark overview doc)
- c) Benchmarks 2018 (Doc 5c)

The secretariat has prepared a draft wokplan for 2017. ACOM is invited to comment on the draft. Following the Consultations, the workplan will be uploaded on the ACOM Forum for adoption by 7th October.

- 6) Role of the Secretariat in stock assessments.

ACOM have had a number of discussions on the need to reduce the workload of the EGs and to have some of the assessment work conducted by the secretariat. Related to this the Council agreed at its meeting in October 2015 to support the transition to a more cost-efficient use of resources in the advisory system (deliver the same, with less resources) and approved two P2 positions.

The Secretariat will give a short report on progress on support to Expert Groups. A proposal for a Transparent Assessment Framework allowing a detailed documentation of data and methods used by Expert Groups will be presented at the joint ACOM/SCICOM meeting.

- 7) Non-fisheries advice (Doc 7a and 7b).

The item includes two sub-items: ACOM's general involvement in requests for advice on non-fisheries issues and how to address request for aquaculture advice.

ACOM's involvement in the advisory process is in general skewed towards advice on fishing opportunities. The relative poor participation of ACOM in non-fisheries requests gives rise to concern and question if the current structure of ACOM supports an appropriate coverage of the range of expertise required to address the requests for advice. Doc 7a provides a number of possible alternative structures. ACOM is invited to discuss in breakout groups:

1. *Why is ACOM's involvement skewed towards advice on fisheries opportunities?*
2. *Is this acceptable? If not, what do we do to address it?*

WGAQUA has, with reference to the 2014 advice to OSPAR on interactions between wild and captive fish stocks and the 2016 advice to NASCO on possible effects of salmonid aquaculture on wild Atlantic salmon populations, questioned the advisory process and expressed needs for an aquaculture advisory process that is more transparent, communicative, credible and effective, and which promotes feedback loops between the EGs, peer-reviewers and the Advice Drafting Group. WGAQUA's concerns are expressed in the Annex 6 to the 2015 WGAQUA report (see doc 7b). After discussion with the chairs of WGAQUA it was agreed to ask ACOM to discuss the issues raised in the annex and to consider WGAQUA's proposal for improving ICES aquaculture advisory process (section 6.2 in the above mentioned annex 6). ACOM is invited to discuss the issue including WGAQUA's proposal.

8) Technical guidelines (Doc 8)

Status report and discussion of publication.

9) ACOM Chair Recruitment Process Update

10) AOB

- ACOM member of ASC Award Selection Group
- Early career scientist bus stop

11) Closing

Draft timetable for ACOM Consultations

Sunday 18/9

Agenda Item	Hour	Comments
1. Welcome and adoption of agenda	09:00 – 09:15	
2. Review of 2016 and 3. ACOM workplan 2016	09:15 – 10:00	
4. Advisory workplan 2016 and 5. Advisory workplan 2017	10:00 – 10:45	

9. ACOM Chair Recruitment Process Update	10:45 11:00	–	
Coffee	11:00 11:30	–	
Joint ACOM/SCICOM meeting Lunch	11:30 15:15 13:00 14:00	– –	
6. Role of the Secretariat in stock assessments.	15:15 15:30	–	
7. Non-fisheries advice Introduction Breakout groups Plenary discussion	15:30 16:00 16:00 17:30 17:30 18:00	– – –	
7. Technical guidelines	18:00 18:20	–	
10. AOB			
11. Closure	18:30		

Annex 3 List of meeting documents

DOCUMENT NUMBER	TITLE
Doc 01	Draft agenda
Doc 02	Chair's report to ACOM
Doc 04	Advisory workplan for the remainder of 2016
Doc 04b	ADG membership October-December 2016
Doc 05.a.1	Expert Group Chairs – 2016 status
Doc 05.a.2	2017 advisory processes
Doc 05.b	2017 benchmarks
Doc 05.c	2018 benchmarks
Doc 07.a	Non-fisheries advice
Doc 07.b	Annex 6 to ICES WGAQUA report 2015
Doc 08	Status report on progress of the Technical Guidelines
Doc 09	Outcome of ACOM Recruitment Process, 18 September